# National Education Evidence Base, Productivity Commission Draft Report, September 2016 Canberra This is a draft repot prepared for further public consultaion and input. The Commission will finalise its report after these processes have taken place.National Education Evidence Base

Productivity Commission Draft Report

Commonwealth of Australia 2016



Except for the Commonwealth Coat of Arms and content supplied by third parties, this copyright work is licensed under a Creative Commons Attribution 3.0 Australia licence. To view a copy of this licence, visit [<http://creativecommons.org/licenses/by/3.0/au>](http://creativecommons.org/licenses/by/3.0/au). In essence, you are free to copy, communicate and adapt the work, as long as you attribute the work to the Productivity Commission (but not in any way that suggests the Commission endorses you or your use) and abide by the other licence terms.

Use of the Commonwealth Coat of Arms

For terms of use of the Coat of Arms visit the ‘[It’s an Honour](http://www.itsanhonour.gov.au/coat-arms/index.cfm)’ website: <http://www.itsanhonour.gov.au>

Third party copyright

Wherever a third party holds copyright in this material, the copyright remains with that party. Their permission may be required to use the material, please contact them directly.

Attribution

This work should be attributed as follows, *Source: Productivity Commission, National Education Evidence Base, Draft Report.*

If you have adapted, modified or transformed this work in anyway, please use the following, *Source: based on Productivity Commission data, National Education Evidence Base, Draft Report.*

An appropriate reference for this publication is:

Productivity Commission 2016, *National* *Education Evidence Base*, Draft Report, Canberra

Publications enquiries

Media and Publications, phone: (03) 9653 2244 or email: maps@pc.gov.au

|  |
| --- |
| The Productivity Commission |
| The Productivity Commission is the Australian Government’s independent research and advisory body on a range of economic, social and environmental issues affecting the welfare of Australians. Its role, expressed most simply, is to help governments make better policies, in the long term interest of the Australian community.  The Commission’s independence is underpinned by an Act of Parliament. Its processes and outputs are open to public scrutiny and are driven by concern for the wellbeing of the community as a whole.  Further information on the Productivity Commission can be obtained from the Commission’s website ([www.pc.gov.au](http://www.pc.gov.au/)). |
|  |

# Opportunity for further comment

You are invited to examine this draft and comment on it by written submission to the Productivity Commission, preferably in electronic format by 7 October 2016. Further information on how to provide a submission is included on the inquiry website: <http://www.pc.gov.au/inquiries/current/education-evidence>

The Commission will hold public hearings in Melbourne and Sydney. Further locations may be advised if there is sufficient demand by participants. The final report will be forwarded to the Australian Government in December 2016. Under the *Productivity Commission Act 1998* (Cwlth), the Government is required to table the report in each House of the Parliament within 25 sitting days of receipt.

### Public hearing dates and venues

|  |  |  |
| --- | --- | --- |
| **Location** | **Date** | **Venue** |
| Melbourne | 18 October 2016 | Productivity Commission Rattigan Room Level 12/530 Collins Street, Melbourne |
| Sydney | 20 October 2016 | Adina Apartment Hotel Fitzroy Room 359 Crown Street, Sydney |

### Commissioners

For the purposes of this inquiry and draft report, in accordance with section 40 of the *Productivity Commission Act 1998,* the powers of the Productivity Commission have been exercised by:

|  |  |
| --- | --- |
| Jonathan Coppel | Presiding Commissioner |
| Julie Abramson | Commissioner |

# Terms of reference

**Productivity Commission Inquiry into the National Education Evidence Base**

I, SCOTT MORRISON, Treasurer, pursuant to Parts 2 and 3 of the Productivity Commission Act 1998, hereby request that the Productivity Commission undertake an inquiry into the further development of the national evidence base for school and early childhood education.

**Background**

The Australian Government is committed to working collaboratively with the states and territories to build a world-class education system that equips children to succeed in an increasingly competitive world. Having comprehensive and consistent data that underpins a national evidence base will inform education policy and help improve educational outcomes for children.

While a significant amount of data is currently collected on students, schools and the workforce, data reported nationally is more limited and often inconsistent. Valuable data is also collected outside schools, including in early childhood education and care. Improved access and greater ability to link and analyse national data could enhance the quality and scope of national education evidence that can be used to monitor educational outcomes and inform policy development and evaluation.

Through consultation with states and territories, education authorities and other key stakeholders, this Inquiry will help to identify current investment in national data collection and education evidence, opportunities to collectively invest further, and how we can improve the effectiveness of our investment through a more streamlined, comprehensive and collaborative national approach.

Improving the collection and management of education data in Australia will assist to create a more robust national education evidence base for effective policy and program development to meet our national education objectives and lift our national productivity.

**Scope of the Inquiry**

The Commission is to provide advice on the refinement of the national approach to collecting and using data for early childhood education and care and schools, and other information as relevant, to improve Australia’s educational outcomes.

In undertaking this Inquiry, the Commission should use evidence from Australia and overseas to report on and make recommendations about:

1. The information required to provide a comprehensive evidence base to inform policy development in early learning and school education now and in the future. This includes consideration of current data holdings at a national, state and sectoral level, their effectiveness in supporting educational outcomes, and the long term vision for such educational data holdings.
2. What additional information could be considered and how it might add value to the existing evidence base. This may include data concerning non-cognitive skills, and information from other sectors, including but not be limited to: employment, health, social services, early childhood and higher education.
3. Existing or potential barriers to the sharing of education (and other relevant) data and how these can be overcome. Considerations should include, but not be limited to: privacy concerns, costs, technological capacity, sector-based sensitivities, national and jurisdictional data governance structures and workforce capability.
4. Factors that inhibit access to, and consistency of, education-relevant data to support analysis and evidence-based policy development. Considerations should include, but not be limited to: privacy concerns, legislative and technical frameworks, national and jurisdictional data governance structures, workforce research and analytical capabilities, stakeholder engagement, sector-based sensitivities and implementation timeframes.
5. The role technology and mobile devices can play on the scope, quality and timeliness of data collection and reporting.
6. The costs and benefits of options for improvements to the national education evidence base including the administrative and financial impacts on schools and early childhood education and care providers of any suggested change in data collection practices. Consideration should include what opportunities exist to apply efficiencies to existing data collection.
7. How Australian and overseas governments have approached the use of evidence and sharing data to improve outcomes (in education and non-education sectors) and the potential benefits and challenges of adopting these practices in the Australian education context.

**Process**

The Commission is to undertake a public consultation process, including holding hearings, inviting key stakeholder and public submissions, and releasing a draft report.

The final report should be provided within nine months of receipt of these terms of reference.

SCOTT MORRISON  
Treasurer

[Received 11 March 2016]

# Contents

Opportunity for further comment iii

Terms of reference iv

Abbreviations and explanations x

Overview 1

What has the Commission been asked to do? 3

What is a national education evidence base? 4

A framework for furthering the education evidence base 5

Existing data should be collected and used more effectively 8

More work is required to address data gaps 12

Three evidence gaps need attention 14

Action is required to improve evidence creation and use 16

Governance and institutional arrangements matter 18

Draft recommendations, findings and information requests 23

1 About this inquiry 29

1.1 Background and contextual information 29

1.2 What the Commission has been asked to do 41

1.3 Scope of the inquiry 42

1.4 The Commission’s approach 43

1.5 Conduct of the inquiry 45

1.6 A guide to the report 45

2 A framework for furthering the education evidence base 47

2.1 What is a national education evidence base? 48

2.2 A top‑down approach: monitoring, benchmarking and accountability 53

2.3 A bottom‑up approach: evaluation of ‘what works best’ in teaching and learning 60

2.4 Dissemination and application: sharing and using evidence to make a difference 65

2.5 Quality and fitness for purpose 67

2.6 Cost‑effectiveness of the evidence base 71

3 Gaps in education data and evidence 73

3.1 The Australian education data and evidence base 74

3.2 Data quality issues 76

3.3 Gaps in data collections 79

3.4 Gaps in education evidence and its application 93

3.5 Addressing issues in the education evidence base 97

4 Data collection, processing and reporting 99

4.1 Data collection and processing issues 100

4.2 Improving data collection and processing 107

4.3 Data reporting tools 115

5 Access to education data 117

5.1 Privacy regulation impedes access to education data 119

5.2 Other legislative restrictions 134

5.3 Multiple approval processes 139

6 Data linkage 145

6.1 The power of data linkage 146

6.2 Impediments to data linkage 149

7 Creating and using evidence 163

7.1 Creation of education evidence 164

7.2 Improving the use of education evidence 175

8 Governance and institutional arrangements 183

8.1 Existing governance and institutional arrangements 184

8.2 Examples of governance and institutional arrangements for ‘bottom‑up’ evidence creation 191

8.3 The way forward 194

A Public consultation 199

B Data quality issues, and data and evidence gaps: stakeholder summary 205

C Australia’s education data and evidence base 215

C.1 The main collections of education data in Australia 215

C.2 Data on external influences on education outcomes 228

C.3 The main sources of education evidence in Australia 229

References 235

# Abbreviations

|  |  |
| --- | --- |
| ABS | Australian Bureau of Statistics |
| ACARA | Australian Curriculum, Assessment and Reporting Authority |
| ACECQA | Australian Children’s Education and Care Quality Authority |
| AEDC | Australian Early Development Census |
| AESOC | Australian Education Senior Officials Committee |
| AHURI | Australian Housing and Urban Research Institute |
| AIFS | Australian Institute of Family Studies |
| AIHW | Australian Institute of Health and Welfare |
| AITSL | Australian Institute for Teaching and School Leadership |
| ALLD | Australian Longitudinal Learning Database |
| ALRC | Australian Law Reform Commission |
| APP | Australian Privacy Principles |
| AURIN | Australian Urban Research Infrastructure Network |
| BES | Best Evidence Synthesis |
| CCMS | Child Care Management System |
| CYDA | Children and Young People with Disability Australia |
| CESE | Centre for Education Statistics and Evaluation |
| CITO | Central Institute for Test Development |
| COAG | Council of Australian Governments |
| DAC | Data Analytics Centre |
| DET | Australian Government Department of Education and Training |
| DSG | Data Strategy Group |
| EC | Education Council |
| ECEC | Early childhood education and care |
| EEF | Education Endowment Foundation |
| ESA | Education Services Australia |
| HILDA | Household, Income and Labour Dynamics in Australia Survey |
| HREC | Human Research Ethics Committee |
| ICILS | International Computer and Information Literacy Study |
| ICT | Information and communications technology |
| IES | Institute of Education Sciences |
| IPP | Information Privacy Principles |
| IT | Information Technology |
| ISDTN | Interstate Student Data Transfer Note |
| LSAC | Longitudinal Study of Australian Children |
| LSAY | Longitudinal Survey of Australian Children |
| LSIC | Longitudinal Study of Indigenous Children |
| MADIP | Multi‑Agency Data Integration Project |
| MCEETYA | Ministerial Council on Education, Employment, Training and Youth Affairs |
| METeOR | Metadata Only Registry |
| NAP | National Assessment Program |
| NAPLAN | National Assessment Program – Literacy and Numeracy |
| NCCD | Nationally Consistent Collection of Data on School Students with Disability |
| NCRIS | National Collaborative Research Infrastructure Strategy |
| NECD RD | National Early Childhood Development Researchable Data Set |
| NECECC | National Early Childhood Education and Care Collection |
| NCVER | National Centre for Vocational Education Research |
| NHMRC | National Health and Medical Research Council |
| NMA | National Mutual Acceptance |
| NPSI | National Plan for School Improvement |
| NQA ITS | National Quality Agenda IT System |
| NQF | National Quality Framework |
| NSSC | National School Statistics Collection |
| NSIP | National Schools Interoperability Program |
| OAIC | Office of the Australian Information Commissioner |
| OECD | Organisation for Economic Co-operation and Development |
| PHRN | Public Health Research Network |
| PIRLS | Progress in International Reading Literacy Study |
| PISA | Programme for International Student Assessment |
| SCRGSP | Steering Committee for the Review of Government Service Provision |
| SCSEEC | Standing Council on School Education and Early Childhood |
| SIF | Systems Interoperability Framework |
| SRC | Social Research Centre |
| SURE | Secure United Research Environment |
| SVA | Social Ventures Australia |
| TAFE | Technical and further education |
| TALIS | Teaching and Learning International Survey |
| TIMSS | Trends in International Mathematics and Science Study |
| USI | Unique Student Identifier |
| VSN | Victorian Student Number |
| VET | Vocational education and training |