Cover image for the Productivity Commission draft report titled 'Public Infrastrucutre'. Volume Two. Published March 2014. 
This is a draft report prepared for further public consultaton and input. The Commission will finalise its report after these processes have taken place.

Commonwealth of Australia 2014

This work is copyright. Apart from any use as permitted under the *Copyright Act 1968*, the work may be reproduced in whole or in part for study or training purposes, subject to the inclusion of an acknowledgment of the source. Reproduction for commercial use or sale requires prior written permission from the Productivity Commission. Requests and inquiries concerning reproduction and rights should be addressed to Media and Publications (see below).

*This publication is available from the Productivity Commission website at www.pc.gov.au. If you require part or all of this publication in a different format, please contact Media and Publications.*

**Publications Inquiries:**

Media and Publications

Productivity Commission

Locked Bag 2 Collins Street East

Melbourne VIC 8003

Tel: (03) 9653 2244

Fax: (03) 9653 2303  
Email: maps@pc.gov.au

**General Inquiries:**

Tel: (03) 9653 2100 or (02) 6240 3200

**An appropriate citation for this paper is:**

Productivity Commission 2014, *Public Infrastructure*, Draft Inquiry Report, Canberra.

The Productivity Commission

The Productivity Commission is the Australian Government’s independent research and advisory body on a range of economic, social and environmental issues affecting the welfare of Australians. Its role, expressed most simply, is to help governments make better policies, in the long term interest of the Australian community.

The Commission’s independence is underpinned by an Act of Parliament. Its processes and outputs are open to public scrutiny and are driven by concern for the wellbeing of the community as a whole.

Further information on the Productivity Commission can be obtained from the Commission’s website (www.pc.gov.au) or by contacting Media and Publications on (03) 9653 2244 or email: maps@pc.gov.au

# Opportunity for further comment

You are invited to examine this draft inquiry report and comment on it by written submission to the Productivity Commission, preferably in electronic format, by Friday 4 April 2014 and/or by attending a public hearing.

The final report will be prepared after submissions have been received and will be forwarded to the Australian Government in May 2014.

Further information on how to provide a written submission or register your attendance at the public hearings (as a participant or an observer) is available on the inquiry website: www.pc.gov.au/projects/inquiry/infrastructure.

**Public hearing dates and venues**

|  |  |  |
| --- | --- | --- |
| Location | Date | Venue |
| Melbourne | Wednesday 9 April 2014 | Productivity Commission  Rattigan Room Level 12, 530 Collins Street |
| Brisbane | Friday 11 April 2014 | Mercure Hotel Brisbane Burke Room 85-87 North Quay |
| Sydney | Monday 14 April 2014 | The Grace Hotel Pinaroo 5 Room 77 York Street |

**Commissioners**

For the purposes of this inquiry and draft report, in accordance with section 40 of the *Productivity Commission Act 1998* the powers of the Productivity Commission have been exercised by:

|  |  |
| --- | --- |
| Peter Harris AO | Presiding Commissioner |
| Dr Warren Mundy | Commissioner |
| Paul Lindwall | Associate Commissioner |

Contents

The Commission’s report is in two volumes. **This volume 2 contains chapters 8 to 14 and appendixes A to D.** Volume 1 contains the Overview, draft recommendations and findings and chapters 1 to 7. Below is the table of contents for both volumes.

Volume 1

Opportunity for further comment iii

Terms of reference v

Abbreviations and explanations xv

Overview 1

Draft recommendations, findings and information requests 33

1 Introduction 45

1.1 What has the Commission been asked to do? 46

1.2 Australia’s public infrastructure and its importance 49

1.3 The role of government in infrastructure provision 53

1.4 The increasing role of the private sector 55

1.5 The Commission’s approach 62

1.6 Conduct of the inquiry 65

1.7 Guide to the draft report 66

2 Efficient provision 69

2.1 The importance of project selection 70

2.2 The role of cost–benefit analysis 72

2.3 Alternative institutional and governance arrangements 80

2.4 Reforming institutional arrangements 87

3 Achieving benefits from private sector involvement 89

3.1 The various models of public infrastructure provision 91

3.2 The potential benefits and challenges of private sector involvement in infrastructure delivery 93

3.3 Selecting a delivery model 101

3.4 Principles for efficient risk allocation 104

3.5 Risk allocation in practice 113

3.6 Assessing value for money under different delivery models 117

3.7 The importance of government institutions and governance 120

4 Funding mechanisms 121

4.1 User charges 122

4.2 Value capture 142

4.3 Developer contributions 147

4.4 Government funding 150

5 Raising finance 155

5.1 The role of the private sector has grown 156

5.2 Sources of public sector finance 158

5.3 Sources of private sector finance 160

6 Financing mechanisms 173

6.1 Assessment framework 174

6.2 Assessment of alternative financing mechanisms 184

7 Improving governance and institutional arrangements 217

7.1 The case for governance and institutional reform 218

7.2 Principles for good governance 221

7.3 Current institutional arrangements for infrastructure provision 224

7.4 Options for improving governance and institutional arrangements in the roads sector 235

7.5 The influence of the Australian Government 254

References 265

Volume 2

8 Cost drivers, trends and benchmarks 277

8.1 What has been happening to aggregate construction costs? 280

8.2 Input cost drivers and trends 282

8.3 Interim summing up 292

8.4 Benchmarking 293

8.5 International comparisons of cost 303

8.6 Concluding comments 305

9 Productivity issues 307

9.1 Recent Australian performance 308

9.2 Main productivity challenges 325

9.3 Concluding comments 334

10 Competition and the structure of the infrastructure construction market 335

10.1 Concentration in the infrastructure construction market 337

10.2 Barriers to entry 342

10.3 Segmentation in the infrastructure construction market 346

10.4 Countervailing power of government 348

10.5 Competition issues in input markets 349

10.6 Concluding comments 352

11 Tendering and contracting 355

11.1 Tendering and contracting arrangements used for major infrastructure projects 356

11.2 Are government tendering arrangements too onerous? 367

11.3 Do tendering arrangements elicit least cost bids? 379

11.4 Do contracts provide incentives for cost minimisation throughout the build? 394

12 Industrial relations 405

12.1 What is industrial relations? 407

12.2 Industrial relations in the Australian construction sector 408

12.3 A framework for understanding the role of industrial relations in construction 417

12.4 Is construction different in other ways? 423

12.5 The impacts of industrial relations at the project level 429

12.6 The aggregate effects of the IR environment on the construction industry 440

12.7 The scope for improving the IR environment 457

13 Workforce Skills 461

13.1 Evidence of civil construction skill shortages 462

13.2 The impact of skill shortages on infrastructure construction costs 469

13.3 The causes of recent skill shortages 473

13.4 Policy options for skill shortages in infrastructure construction 484

13.5 Conclusion 498

14 Social and environmental regulation 499

14.1 Nature and scope of the regulation 501

14.2 Participants’ concerns 502

14.3 Impacts on costs 505

14.4 General reform issues 506

14.5 Federal safety accreditation 510

14.6 Regulation affecting quarries 517

A Conduct of the inquiry 519

B Australian and international public infrastructure case studies 527

C Building information modelling 557

D EBAs: A small sample analysis 561

References 581