Workplace Relations Framework Productivity Commission Draft Report August 2015. 
This is a draft report prepared for further public consultation and input. The Commission will finalise its report after these processes have taken place.
Workplace Relations Framework Productivity Commission Draft Report August 2015.

This is a draft report prepared for further public consultation and input. The Commission will finalise its report after these processes have taken place.

Commonwealth of Australia 2015



Except for the Commonwealth Coat of Arms and content supplied by third parties, this copyright work is licensed under a Creative Commons Attribution 3.0 Australia licence. To view a copy of this licence, visit http://creativecommons.org/licenses/by/3.0/au. In essence, you are free to copy, communicate and adapt the work, as long as you attribute the work to the Productivity Commission (but not in any way that suggests the Commission endorses you or your use) and abide by the other licence terms.

Use of the Commonwealth Coat of Arms

For terms of use of the Coat of Arms visit the ‘It’s an Honour’ website: http://www.itsanhonour.gov.au

Third party copyright

Wherever a third party holds copyright in this material, the copyright remains with that party. Their permission may be required to use the material, please contact them directly.

Attribution

This work should be attributed as follows, *Source: Productivity Commission, Workplace Relations Framework, Draft Report*.

If you have adapted, modified or transformed this work in anyway, please use the following, *Source: based on Productivity Commission data, Workplace Relations Framework, Draft Report*.

An appropriate reference for this publication is:

Productivity Commission 2015, *Workplace Relations Framework*, Draft Report, Canberra

Publications enquiries

Media and Publications, phone: (03) 9653 2244 or email: maps@pc.gov.au

|  |
| --- |
| The Productivity Commission |
| The Productivity Commission is the Australian Government’s independent research and advisory body on a range of economic, social and environmental issues affecting the welfare of Australians. Its role, expressed most simply, is to help governments make better policies, in the long term interest of the Australian community.  The Commission’s independence is underpinned by an Act of Parliament. Its processes and outputs are open to public scrutiny and are driven by concern for the wellbeing of the community as a whole.  Further information on the Productivity Commission can be obtained from the Commission’s website (www.pc.gov.au). |
|  |

# Opportunity for further comment

You are invited to examine this draft and comment on it by written submission to the Productivity Commission, preferably in electronic format, by **18 September 2015**. Further information on how to provide a submission is included on the inquiry website http://www.pc.gov.au/inquiries/current/workplace-relations.

The final report will be prepared after further submissions have been received and public hearings have been held, and will be forwarded to the Australian Government by the end of November 2015.

### Public hearing dates and venues

| **Location** | **Date** | **Venue** |
| --- | --- | --- |
| Bendigo, VIC | Friday 4 September 2015 | TBC |
| Hobart, TAS | Monday 7 September 2015 | The Old Woolstore  1 Macquarie Street |
| Melbourne, VIC | Tuesday 8 September 2015 | Rattigan Room  Productivity Commission  Level 12, 530 Collins Street |
| Canberra, ACT | Friday 11 September 2015 | Hearing Room  Productivity Commission  Level 2, 15 Moore Street |
| Perth, WA | Monday 14 September 2015 | Hotel Mercure Perth  10 Irwin Street |
| Adelaide, SA | Tuesday 15 September 2015 | Stamford Plaza Adelaide  150 North Terrace |
| Sydney, NSW | Thursday 17 September 2015 | The Grace Hotel  77 York Street |
| Ipswich, QLD | Monday 21 September 2015 | TBC |

### Commissioners

For the purposes of this inquiry and draft report, in accordance with section 40 of the *Productivity Commission Act 1998* the powers of the Productivity Commission have been exercised by:

Peter Harris Presiding Commissioner

Patricia Scott Commissioner

# Terms of reference

WORKPLACE RELATIONS FRAMEWORK

***Productivity Commission Act 1998***

I, Joseph Benedict Hockey, Treasurer, pursuant to Parts 2 and 3 of the *Productivity Commission Act 1998*, hereby request that the Productivity Commission undertake an inquiry into the workplace relations framework.

**Background**

The Australian Government believes that it is fundamentally important to make sure that the Fair Work laws work for everyone.

Workplaces are important to our economy and society. Higher living standards, better pay and more jobs all depend on having fair, productive, and effective workplaces. The prosperity of tomorrow is driven by what happens in our workplaces today and this is why it is in our national interest to make sure that the Fair Work laws are balanced and effective.

The Australian Government’s objectives in commissioning this Inquiry are to examine the current operation of the Fair Work Laws and identify future options to improve the laws bearing in mind the need to ensure workers are protected and the need for business to be able to grow, prosper and employ.

**Scope of the Inquiry**

The Productivity Commission will assess the performance of the workplace relations framework, including the *Fair Work Act 2009*, focussing on key social and economic indicators important to the wellbeing, productivity and competitiveness of Australia and its people. A key consideration will be the capacity for the workplace relations framework to adapt over the longer term to issues arising due to structural adjustments and changes in the global economy.

In particular, the review will assess the impact of the workplace relations framework on matters including:

* unemployment, underemployment and job creation
* fair and equitable pay and conditions for employees, including the maintenance of a relevant safety net
* small businesses
* productivity, competitiveness and business investment
* the ability of business and the labour market to respond appropriately to changing economic conditions
* patterns of engagement in the labour market
* the ability for employers to flexibly manage and engage with their employees
* barriers to bargaining
* red tape and the compliance burden for employers
* industrial conflict and days lost due to industrial action
* appropriate scope for independent contracting.

In addition to assessing the overall impact of the workplace relations framework on these matters, the review should consider the Act’s performance against its stated aims and objects, and the impact on jobs, incomes and the economy. The review should examine the impact of the framework according to business size, region, and industry sector. It should also examine the experience of countries in the Organisation for Economic Co‑operation and Development.

The workplace relations framework encompasses the *Fair Work Act 2009*, including the institutions and instruments that operate under the Act; and the *Independent Contractors Act 2006*.

The review will make recommendations about how the laws can be improved to maximise outcomes for Australian employers, employees and the economy, bearing in mind the need to ensure workers are protected, the need for business to be able to grow, prosper and employ, and the need to reduce unnecessary and excessive regulation.

The Productivity Commission will identify and quantify, as far as possible, the full costs and benefits of its recommendations.

An overarching principle for any recommendations should be the need to ensure a framework to serve the country in the long term, given the level of legislative change in this area in recent years.

In conducting the review, the Productivity Commission will draw on the full spectrum of evidence sources including, but not limited to:

* Australian Bureau of Statistics data and publications
* data sources maintained by other relevant Government bodies, including but not limited to the Department of Employment, Fair Work Commission and Fair Work Ombudsman
* employers or their representatives
* employees or their representatives
* academia
* special interest groups.

The review should also identify gaps in the evidence base where further collection may assist in the analysis of the overall performance and impact of the system.

**Process**

The Commission is to undertake an appropriate public consultation process including holding hearings, inviting public submissions and releasing a draft report to the public.

The final report should be provided to the Government in November 2015.

J. B. HOCKEY

Treasurer

[Received 19 December 2014]

Contents

Opportunity for further comment iii

Terms of reference iv

Abbreviations and explanations xiii

Overview 1

Draft recommendations, findings and information requests 45

1 Introduction 63

1.1 The inquiry terms of reference 64

1.2 Australia’s workplace relation system 67

1.3 The past and the future cannot be ignored 71

1.4 The Productivity Commission’s conceptual framework 75

1.5 Considerations for assessing policy proposals 80

1.6 Conduct of the inquiry 83

1.7 Guide to the draft report 84

2 Developments in Australia’s labour market 87

2.1 A snapshot of the Australian labour market 89

2.2 Who works? Participation and the composition of the labour force 91

2.3 Not just full‑time employees — more variety in forms of work 99

2.4 Job tenure and turnover 109

2.5 Can people who want to work get a job? Labour utilisation 114

2.6 Some measures of flexibility in labour markets 119

2.7 Wages 121

2.8 Workplace relations and the furture of work 125

2.9 The bottom line 128

3 Institutions 129

3.1 The current system 131

3.2 How are the institutions performing? 140

3.3 Reform options 147

4 National Employment Standards 163

4.1 Some economic aspects of job conditions and entitlements 167

4.2 Long service leave 172

4.3 Public holidays 182

4.4 Sick and annual leave for casual workers 195

5 Unfair dismissal 199

5.1 The institutional setting 200

5.2 The incidence and costs of unfair dismissal cases in Australia 209

5.3 Impacts on employment and productivity 213

5.4 How does Australia compare internationally? 217

5.5 The performance of the current system 220

5.6 Reform options 229

6 The general protections 241

6.1 Key features of the general protections 242

6.2 Adequacy of current arrangements 249

6.3 Further reforms to the general protections 259

7 Anti-bullying 267

7.1 Anti-bullying protections 268

7.2 Evidence on prevalence and cost 272

7.3 How well is the current jurisdiction performing? 278

7.4 A further review? 283

8 Minimum wages 285

8.1 Australia’s minimum wages 287

8.2 What effect does the minimum wage have on employment? 291

8.3 What effect do minimum wage requirements have on workers’ incomes and living standards? 310

8.4 The future of the minimum wage 327

9 Variations from uniform minimum wages 335

9.1 Geographical variations in minimum wages 336

9.2 Junior pay rates 351

9.3 Arrangements for apprentices and trainees 359

10 Measures to complement minimum wages 373

10.1 Earned income tax credits 375

10.2 Other policies to enhance the wellbeing of low paid workers and jobseekers 386

11 Role of awards 391

11.1 Introduction to modern awards 392

11.2 Coverage and application of awards 395

11.3 History of awards 401

11.4 Awards in the modern era — the shift to a safety net 413

11.5 What role do awards play? 416

11.6 Is there another way? 420

12 Repairing awards 427

12.1 Award assessments within the Minimum Standards Division 428

12.2 Making awards easier to use 436

12.3 Assessing the complex and critical issues 439

12.4 Assessments of minimum wage rates and classifications in awards 441

12.5 Assessments of conditions and entitlements in awards 451

13 Penalty rates for long hours and night work 457

13.1 Current regulation of long hours and night work 460

13.2 The prevalence of long hours and night work 466

13.3 Assessing long hours and night work regulation 473

13.4 A case for reform? 481

14 Regulated weekend penalty rates for selected consumer services 483

14.1 Weekend penalty rate arrangements 486

14.2 The shift to a seven‑day consumer economy 493

14.3 The effects of working on weekends for employees and their families 499

14.4 The implications of the higher value people place on weekends 503

14.5 What does the evidence suggest about the level of penalty rates? 507

14.6 The impacts of change 516

14.7 Change is warranted 526

14.8 Other industries 528

14.9 Holiday pay 532

15 Enterprise bargaining 533

15.1 Collective bargaining in Australia 534

15.2 Current rules around enterprise bargaining 537

15.3 Patterns in the use of enterprise agreements 549

15.4 Adequacy of current arrangements and possible reforms 551

15.5 Is enterprise bargaining suited to changing ways of working? 587

16 Individual arrangements 591

16.1 Why employers and employees use individual arrangements 592

16.2 Forms of statutory individual arrangements 596

16.3 Issues with individual flexibility arrangements 600

16.4 Retained safeguards 611

17 The enterprise contract 615

17.1 The gap in employment arrangements 616

17.2 Could common law contracts fill the gap? 619

17.3 A better option to bridge the gap — the enterprise contract 620

17.4 Possible implementation impacts 625

18 Public sector bargaining 629

18.1 Some features of public sector bargaining 631

18.2 Bargaining with the decision maker 639

18.3 Good faith bargaining in the public sector 641

18.4 Productivity in the Public Sector 642

18.5 Performance management in the public sector 644

18.6 Other public sector concerns 646

19 Industrial disputes and right of entry 649

19.1 Bargaining disputes can lead to industrial action 650

19.2 How well are the current arrangements performing? 660

19.3 Reform possibilities to improve the framework 671

19.4 What are the likely impacts of these reforms? 700

19.5 Right of entry 702

20 Alternative forms of employment 711

20.1 Some characteristics of alternative forms of employment 713

20.2 Sham contracting 721

20.3 Limitations on the use of subcontractors and labour hire employees 729

20.4 Other forms of work 733

21 Migrant workers 741

22 Transfer of business 751

22.1 The effects on employment 754

22.2 Transfers of business between state and national system employers 756

22.3 The ‘nuisance’ cost when workers change work voluntarily 758

23 International obligations 761

23.1 International Labour Standards 761

23.2 Preferential trade agreements 766

24 Interactions between competition policy and the workplace relations framework 769

24.1 How does competition policy currently interact with the WR system? 770

24.2 Competition policy and the WR system have commonalities and divergences 772

24.3 Competition policy cannot subsume the WR system 776

24.4 Are there gaps in the WR system that allow anti‑competitive conduct 778

25 Compliance costs 785

25.1 Sources of compliance costs 786

25.2 Compliance costs were expected to be transitional in nature 788

25.3 Are compliance costs an ongoing concern? 789

25.4 Addressing unnecessary compliance costs 798

26 Impacts 801

26.1 Impacts of changes to employment protection 802

26.2 Impacts of changes to minimum wages and conditions 808

26.3 Impacts of changes to bargaining regimes 811

26.4 Impacts of making it easier to form agreements 818

26.5 Fiscal impacts 819

26.6 Summary 820

A Conduct of the inquiry 825

B Unfair dismissal data 837

C Australian empirical studies of wage employment effects 843

D Employment arrangements 881

E Statistical overview of employment arrangements 901

F Penalty rates 921

References 939

# Abbreviations and explanations

Abbreviations

ABCC Australian Building and Construction Commission

ABS Australian Bureau of Statistics

ACAS Advisory, Conciliation and Arbitration Service

ACCC Australian Competition and Consumer Commission

ACCI Australian Chamber of Commerce and Industry

ACOSS Australian Council of Social Service

ACREW Australian Centre for Research in Employment and Work

ACTU Australian Council of Trade Unions

AHA Australian Hotels Association

AHRI Australian Human Resources Institute

AIRC Australian Industrial Relations Commission

ALAEA Australian Licenced Aircraft Engineers Association

AMMA Australian Metal and Mines Association

AMWU Australian Manufacturing Workers’ Union

ANAO Australian National Audit Office

ANZSIC Australian and New Zealand Standard Industrial Classification

APPEA Australian Petroleum Production & Exploration Association

APS Australian Public Service

APSC Australian Public Service Commission

AWA Australian Workplace Agreement

AWALI Australian Work and Life Index

AWRS Australian Workplace Relations Study

AWU Australian Workers Union

BCA Business Council of Australia

BOOT Better Off Overall Test

BRICS Brazil, Russia, India, China and South Africa

BRIT Bendigo Regional Institute of Technical and Further Education

CEPU Communications, Electrical, Electric ,Electronic, Energy, Information, Postal, Plumbing and Allied Services Union of Australia

CFMEU Construction, Forestry, Mining and Energy Union

CGE Computable General Equilibrium

CMS Case Management System

COAG Council of Australian Governments

COAT Council of Australasian Tribunals

COSBOA Council of Small Business Australia

CPI Consumer Price Index

CPSU Community and Public Sector Union

CURF Confidentialised Unit Record File

DEEWR Department of Education, Employment and Workplace Relations

DET Department of Education and Training

DFAT Department of Foreign Affairs and Trade

DIBP Department of Immigration and Border Protection

EA Enterprise Agreement

EBA Enterprise Bargaining Agreement

EITC Earned Income Tax Credit

EPL Employment Protection Legislation

FWA Fair Work Australia

FWAFB Fair Work Australia Full Bench

FWBC Fair Work Building and Construction

FWC Fair Work Commission

FWCFB Fair Work Commission Full Bench

FWO Fair Work Ombudsman

GDP Gross Domestic Product

HILDA Household, Income and Labour Dynamics in Australia

HR Human Resources

HSU Health Services Union

IFA Individual Flexibility Arrangement

ILO International Labour Organization

IR Industrial Relations

IRC Industrial Relations Commission

LITO Low Income Tax Offset

MBA Master Builders Australia

MUA Maritime Union of Australia

NAIRU Non-Accelerating Inflation Rate of Unemployment

NATSEM National Centre for Social and Economic Modelling

NBER National Bureau of Economic Research

NCC National Competition Council

NCOSS Council of Social Service of New South Wales

NES National Employment Standards

NTEU National Tertiary Education Union

OECD Organisation for Economic Cooperation and Development

OLS Ordinary Least Squares

PAYG Pay As You Go

PC Productivity Commission

PIR Post-Implementation Review

PISA Programme for International Student Assessment

PPP Purchasing Power Parity

QUT Queensland University of Technology

RBA Reserve Bank of Australia

SACES South Australian Centre for Economic Studies

TCF Textile, Clothing and Footwear

TCFUA Textile, Clothing and Footwear Union of Australia

TRYM Treasury Macroeconomic

TWU Transport Workers Union

UNSW University of New South Wales

VECCI Victorian Employers’ Chamber of Commerce and Industry

WAIRC Western Australian Industrial Relations Commission

WHS Workplace Health and Safety

WR Workplace Relations

WTO World Trade Organization

Explanations

|  |  |
| --- | --- |
| Billion | The convention used for a billion is a thousand million (109). |