Cover image for the Australian Government Productivity Commission staff working paper titled 'Productivity in Manufacturing: Measuremetn and Interpretation' by Paula Barnes, Leo Soames, Cindy Li and Marcelo Munoz.
The views expressed in this paper are those of the staff involved and do not necessarily reflect the views of the Productivity Commission.

Commonwealth of Australia 2013

**ISBN 978-1-74037-464-4**

This work is copyright. Apart from any use as permitted under the *Copyright Act 1968*, the work may be reproduced in whole or in part for study or training purposes, subject to the inclusion of an acknowledgment of the source. Reproduction for commercial use or sale requires prior written permission from the Productivity Commission. Requests and inquiries concerning reproduction and rights should be addressed to Media and Publications (see below).

*This publication is available from the Productivity Commission website at www.pc.gov.au. If you require part or all of this publication in a different format, please contact Media and Publications.*

**Publications Inquiries:**

Media and Publications

Productivity Commission

Locked Bag 2 Collins Street East

Melbourne VIC 8003

Tel: (03) 9653 2244

Fax: (03) 9653 2303  
Email: maps@pc.gov.au

**General Inquiries:**

Tel: (03) 9653 2100 or (02) 6240 3200

**An appropriate citation for this paper is:**

Barnes, P., Soames, L., Li, C. and Munoz, M. 2013, *Productivity in Manufacturing: Measurement and Interpretation,* Productivity Commission Staff Working Paper, Canberra.

The Productivity Commission

The Productivity Commission is the Australian Government’s independent research and advisory body on a range of economic, social and environmental issues affecting the welfare of Australians. Its role, expressed most simply, is to help governments make better policies, in the long term interest of the Australian community.

The Commission’s independence is underpinned by an Act of Parliament. Its processes and outputs are open to public scrutiny and are driven by concern for the wellbeing of the community as a whole.

Further information on the Productivity Commission can be obtained from the Commission’s website (www.pc.gov.au) or by contacting Media and Publications on (03) 9653 2244 or email: maps@pc.gov.au

Contents

Acknowledgments xiii

Abbreviations and explanations xiv

Key points 2

Overview 3

1 Introduction and background 17

1.1 Heterogeneous nature of the sector 18

1.2 Objectives 20

1.3 Structure of the paper 21

2 Aggregate Manufacturing productivity 23

2.1 Manufacturing in context 23

2.2 Productivity growth in Manufacturing in aggregate 28

2.3 Proximate causes of Manufacturing MFP growth 34

2.4 Influences on productivity 39

3 Productivity growth at the subsector level 51

3.1 Subsectors within Manufacturing 51

3.2 Productivity growth in Manufacturing subsectors 53

3.3 Proximate causes of subsector MFP growth 64

3.4 Selection of subsectors for detailed analysis 67

4 Productivity in Petroleum, coal, chemical and rubber products 69

4.1 PCCR subsector structure and characteristics 69

4.2 PCCR’s MFP growth and its proximate causes 73

4.3 Influences on PCCR’s MFP growth 76

4.4 Drawing together the implications for productivity 94

5 Productivity in Food, beverage and tobacco products 97

5.1 FBT subsector scope and structure 97

5.2 FBT’s MFP growth and its proximate causes 99

5.3 Influences on FBT’s MFP growth 102

5.4 A closer look at Wine and Bakery manufacturing 136

5.5 Drawing together the implications for productivity 149

6 Productivity in Metal products 151

6.1 Metal products subsector structure and characteristics 151

6.2 Operating environment for Metal products 155

6.3 MFP growth and its proximate causes in Metal products 161

6.4 Influences on MFP growth in Metal products 164

6.5 Drawing together the implications for productivity 180

A Growth accounting framework and data sources 183

B Manufacturing's input-output linkages 217

C MFP growth cycles for Manufacturing subsectors 227

D Further details about subsector productivity 237

E Sensitivity analysis of MFP estimates 253

F Additional information on Petroleum, coal, chemical and rubber products 261

G Additional information on Food, beverage and tobacco products 269

H Additional information on Metal products 291

References 303

Boxes

2.1 Examining productivity growth over cycles 31

2.2 Gains to trade and productivity 46

3.1 Estimation of subsector capital services 55

4.1 Manufacturing productivity cycles and PCCR 74

4.2 Limitations of VA data for PCCR 77

4.3 Growth of imports in PCCR products 82

5.1 Industry classification for FBT 98

5.2 Broad trends affecting food markets 103

5.3 Private label products 105

5.4 Export propensity and import penetration in FBT 108

5.5 Issues in measuring change in the quality of output 114

5.6 Some influences on investment in FBT 131

5.7 Underutilised capacity in FBT 133

5.8 Some closures and consolidations in FBT 135

5.9 Trends in bakery product purchasing patterns 143

5.10 Growth of non‑factory bakeries 145

6.1 Difficulties in measuring value added in Fabricated metals 167

6.2 Cogeneration 175

6.3 Testing for capital lags 176

A.1 ANZSIC06 Manufacturing subdivisions and groups 185

A.2 Investment over cycles 190

A.3 Effect of using an alternative capital measure 197

A.4 Imputing missing observations in private new capital expenditure data 199

A.5 ANZSIC concordance issues related to business expenditure on R&D 201

B.1 Concordance issues for Printing and recorded media 219

D.1 Contribution of compositional change to MFP growth 240

G.1 Effects on FBT subsector of change from ANZSIC93 to ANZSIC06 270

G.2 Examples of consolidation in Wine manufacturing 285

Figures

1 Manufacturing MFP and its proximate causes over the longer term 4

2 MFP in Manufacturing and market sector, by cycle 5

3 Proximate causes of Manufacturing MFP growth in cycles 3   
and 4 6

4 Subsector MFP growth in cycles 3 and 4 7

5 Change in subsector MFP growth between cycles 3 and 4 and contributions to Manufacturing MFP growth in total 8

6 Main subsectors contributing to change in total Manufacturing MFP growth and its proximate causes between cycles 3 and 4 9

7 Petroleum and chemicals: proximate causes of MFP growth in cycles 3 and 4 10

8 Food and beverages: proximate causes of MFP growth in cycles 3 and 4 12

9 Metal products: proximate causes of MFP growth in cycles 3 and 4 14

1.1 MFP in Manufacturing and the market sector 18

1.2 Subsector shares of Manufacturing value added and employment, 2009-10 19

2.1 Manufacturing value added: level and share of market sector 23

2.2 Manufacturing hours worked: level and share of market sector 25

2.3 Manufacturing investment: level and share of market sector 26

2.4 LP in Manufacturing and the market sector 30

2.5 MFP in Manufacturing and the market sector by cycle 33

2.6 MFP and its proximate causes 35

2.7 Capital-labour ratio in Manufacturing and the market sector 36

2.8 Average age of the capital stock in Manufacturing 36

2.9 Growth in Manufacturing MFP and its proximate causes by cycle 37

2.10 Growth in Manufacturing MFP and its proximate causes in cycles 3 and 4 39

2.11 Manufacturing R&D and MFP 41

2.12 Manufacturing capacity utilisation measures 43

2.13 Manufacturing trade volumes and the exchange rate 47

2.14 Import penetration, export propensity and MFP in Manufacturing 48

2.15 Manufacturing MFP and profitability 49

3.1 Subsector shares of Manufacturing value added, 2009-10 52

3.2 Subsector shares of Manufacturing value added, 1985-86 to 2010-11 52

3.3 Discrepancies in capital services and MFP 56

3.4 MFP by Manufacturing subsector 57

3.5 Change in subsector MFP growth rates between cycles 3 and 4 59

3.6 Breakdown of subsector LP growth by cycle 61

3.7 Subsector contributions to the change in Manufacturing MFP growth between cycles 3 and 4 63

3.8 Subsector contributions to the change in Manufacturing MFP growth and its proximate causes between cycles 3 and 4 66

3.9 Main subsectors contributing to change in the proximate causes of Manufacturing MFP growth between cycles 3 and 4 68

4.1 Measures of capital intensity for PCCR 71

4.2 R&D intensity for PCCR and constituent subdivisions 72

4.3 PCCR and Manufacturing MFP 73

4.4 Growth in PCCR MFP and its proximate causes by cycle 75

4.5 Growth in PCCR MFP and its proximate causes in cycles 3 and 4 76

4.6 Production, consumption and imports of refined fuels 79

4.7 Australian production and consumption of diesel and gasoline 80

4.8 PCCR imports, exports and the exchange rate 81

4.9 VA and imports of tyres and related products 84

4.10 Construction boom and VA of selected PCCR products 86

4.11 PCCR gross fixed capital formation by asset type 88

4.12 PCCR gross fixed capital formation by subdivision and asset type 90

5.1 Composition of FBT value added and employment, 2009‑10 99

5.2 FBT and Manufacturing MFP 100

5.3 Growth in FBT MFP and its proximate causes by cycle 101

5.4 Growth in FBT MFP and its components in cycles 3 and 4 102

5.5 FBT net exports and the exchange rate 107

5.6 FBT real VA 110

5.7 FBT nominal VA by ANZSIC group 111

5.8 Composition of nominal VA in FBT by ANZSIC group 113

5.9 FBT MFP and profitability 115

5.10 FBT imports and exports 116

5.11 Net exports by FBT product group 117

5.12 Value added in FBT and Agriculture, and rainfall 118

5.13 Ratio of intermediate inputs to sales and service income 119

5.14 FBT employment and hours worked 120

5.15 Contributions of FBT subdivisions to average annual growth in total hours worked in the FBT subsector 121

5.16 Hours worked by Food manufacturing group 122

5.17 Contributions of FBT groups to average annual growth in total hours worked in the FBT subsector 123

5.18 Employed persons per $m of real value added in FBT by ANZSIC group 125

5.19 Shifts in the scale of FBT businesses 126

5.20 Small‑scale FBT businesses by ANZSIC group 127

5.21 FBT gross fixed capital formation by asset type 129

5.22 R&D intensity for FBT 129

5.23 FBT gross fixed capital formation by subdivision and asset type 130

5.24 Wine manufacturing output and exports 137

5.25 Composition of Bakery product manufacturing, 2008‑09 140

5.26 Value added, investment and labour input in Bakery product manufacturing 141

5.27 Bakery product manufacturing businesses by size, 2006‑07 146

6.1 Measures of capital intensity for Metal products 154

6.2 R&D intensity for Metal products 155

6.3 Changes in selected non-ferrous metal prices by cycle 156

6.4 Country/region share of world steel production 157

6.5 Steel prices 157

6.6 Australian trade in Iron and Steel 158

6.7 Real value added of Metal products and Construction 159

6.8 Changing use of the output of Metal products 160

6.9 MFP in Metal products and Manufacturing 161

6.10 MFP growth and its proximate causes in Metal products by cycle 162

6.11 MFP growth and its proximate causes in Metal products, cycles 3 and 4 163

6.12 Sales in Metal products subdivisions 165

6.13 Metal products gross fixed capital formation by asset type 170

6.14 Metal products gross fixed capital formation by subdivision and asset type 171

6.15 Net capital expenditure of Metal products subsector 173

6.16 Net capital expenditure of Fabricated metals subdivision 179

A.1 A stylised representation of capital services 189

A.2 Capital services discrepancy 193

A.3 Current price investment measures for Manufacturing 196

A.4 Capital income shares 214

A.5 MFP discrepancy 216

C.1 MFP growth by Manufacturing subsector, over subsector-specific cycles compared with over total Manufacturing cycles 230

D.1 Growth in Manufacturing MFP and its proximate causes by cycle 238

D.2 Subsector contributions to total Manufacturing MFP growth and its proximate causes between cycles 3 and 4 239

D.3 Subsector contributions to total manufacturing MFP growth and its proximate causes between cycle 4 and the incomplete cycle 242

D.4 PCCR MFP growth and its proximate causes by cycle 243

D.5 FBT MFP growth and its proximate causes by cycle 244

D.6 MP MFP growth and its proximate causes by cycle 246

D.7 TCO MFP growth and its proximate causes by cycle 247

D.8 PRM MFP growth and its proximate causes by cycle 248

D.9 ME MFP growth and its proximate causes by cycle 249

D.10 NM MFP growth and its proximate causes by cycle 250

D.11 WP MFP growth and its proximate causes by cycle 251

E.1 Rates of MFP growth in Manufacturing based on capital measure used 256

E.2 Manufacturing capital services with and without R&D 257

F.1 Composition of PCCR — value added, hours worked and investment 262

F.2 Effective rates of assistance, PCCR and Manufacturing 265

G.1 Real VA of FBT 272

G.2 Adjusted real VA of FBT and its subdivisions 272

G.3 Producer price indexes by FBT subdivision 274

G.4 Comparison of data sources for employment in FBT 276

G.5 Comparison of data sources for labour input, selected ANZSIC groups within FBT 277

G.6 Investment by ANZSIC groups/classes within FBT 279

G.7 Food and beverage product imports by economic category 281

G.8 Effective rates of assistance, FBT and Manufacturing 282

G.9 Sales and inventories of Australian wine 283

G.10 Nominal value added of Bakery product manufacturing 287

G.11 Employment in Bakery product manufacturing 288

G.12 Investment of Bakery product manufacturing 289

H.1 Composition of Metals products — value added, hours worked and investment 292

H.2 Real exports and imports of metal products 295

H.3 Effective rates of assistance, Metal products and Manufacturing 297

H.4 Employment in Metal products 300

H.5 Employment in Metal products subdivisions 301

Tables

2.1 Shares of market sector output, labour and capital, 2010‑11 24

2.2 Input-output linkages between sectors, 2008-09 27

2.3 Growth in LP, MFP and capital deepening, Manufacturing 31

2.4 Contributions to average annual growth in market sector MFP 34

3.1 Manufacturing subsector MFP growth by cycle 58

3.2 Manufacturing subsector LP growth by cycle 60

3.3 Subsector contributions to Manufacturing MFP growth by cycle 62

3.4 Proximate causes of subsector MFP growth by cycle 65

4.1 Activities within the Petroleum, coal, chemical and rubber products subsector 69

4.2 Composition of PCCR, 2009-10 70

4.3 Import trends in chemical and polymer products 83

4.4 Growth in hours worked for PCCR subdivisions 93

5.1 Labour intensity of Bakery product manufacturing, 2006‑07 147

6.1 Activities within the Metal products subsector 151

6.2 Composition of Metal products subsector, 2007-08 153

6.3 Estimated growth in output volumes of primary metal products 166

6.4 Estimated contributions to growth in nominal value added of Fabricated metals 168

6.5 Breakdown of net capital expenditure of Metal products subsector 172

6.6 Metal products hours worked 180

A.1 Manufacturing subsectors and ANZSIC06 Manufacturing subdivisions 184

A.2 ANZSIC93 correspondence to ANZSIC06 Manufacturing subsectors 186

A.3 Comparison of asset types included in capital services 191

A.4 Apportionment of Manufacturing gross fixed capital formation to subsectors 192

A.5 Missing PNCE data by Manufacturing subdivision and asset type, 1987‑88 to 2010‑11 198

A.6 PIM parameters used by the ABS and in this paper 203

A.7 Superannuation assumptions used in income shares 207

A.8 Conversion factors: ASIC/ANZSIC93 and ANZSIC93/06 210

A.9 Conversion factors: Cat. no. 8221.0 to Cat. no. 8155.0 211

A.10 Conversion factors: Cat. no. 8103.0 to Cat. no. 8221.0 212

A.11 Bridging factors: establishments to management units 213

B.1 Input-output linkages between sectors, 2008-09 220

B.2 Input-output linkages of Manufacturing subsectors, 2008-09 222

B.3 Supply of Manufacturing intermediate inputs to industry sector 223

B.4 Breakdown of Manufacturing subsector output into industry and final use categories, 2001-02 and 2008-09 224

C.1 Peaks identified for use in subsector-specific MFP growth cycles 228

C.2 MFP growth over subsector-specific cycles compared with over total Manufacturing cycles 229

C.3 Comparison of Food, beverage and tobacco products cycles and Agriculture cycles 233

C.4 Comparison of Non-metallic mineral products, Metal products and Construction cycles 234

C.5 Comparison of Petroleum, coal, chemical and rubber products, Metal products and Mining cycles 235

E.1 Growth in income-share weighted capital services in cycle 4 254

E.2 Subsector contributions to the change in Manufacturing MFP growth between cycles 3 and 4, based on GFCF-apportioned and PNCE-based capital services measures 255

E.3 Contributions to capital services growth attributo R&D 257

E.4 Changes needed in selected subsectors and Manufacturing in total to achieve zero MFP growth in cycle 4 259

F.1 Comparison of PCCR output measures and prices 263

F.2 Contribution of PCCR groups to PCCR subdivision hours worked growth 266

G.1 Shift-share analysis of FBT labour intensity, 2003-04 to 2006-07 278

G.2 FBT input-output linkages, 2008-09 280

G.3 Breakdown of FBT output into industry and final use, 2008-09 281

G.4 Number of wine makers in Australia, by tonnes crushed 284

H.1 Comparison of output measures and prices for Metal products 294

H.2 Real exports and imports of metal products on an SITC basis 296

H.3 Downstream users’ share of total supply from Australian Metal product manufacturing 298

H.4 Effect of two- and three-year capital lags on MFP in Metal products 299

H.5 Estimated contributions to growth in employment in Fabricated metals 302

# Acknowledgments

The authors wish to thank the various organisations who were consulted during the course of this study and provided valuable assistance, including: Australian Aluminium Council, Australian Bureau of Agricultural and Resource Economics and Sciences,Australian Chambers of Commerce and Industry, Australian Food and Grocery Council, Australian Industry Group, Australian Institute of Petroleum, Australian Steel Institute, Bureau of Resources and Energy Economics, Business Council of Australia, Dairy Australia, Department of Industry, Medicines Australia, National Baking Industry Association, Plastics and Chemicals Industries Association, Reserve Bank of Australia, Victorian Department of Business and Innovation, and Winemakers Federation of Australia.

The Australian Bureau of Statistics provided vital assistance through the provision of data, and advice on data issues and productivity measurement. Derek Burnell, Paul Roberts, Matt Berger and Liz Bolzan deserve special mention for their assistance.

Helpful comments on the draft paper were received from Noel Gaston, Jenny Gordon, Lisa Gropp, Peter Harris, Alan Johnston, Patrick Laplagne, Daryl Quinlivan, Mike Woods and Shiji Zhao (Productivity Commission), and from the Australian Bureau of Statistics, Australian Bureau of Agricultural and Resource Economics and Sciences, and the Department of Industry. Tracey Horsfall from the Productivity Commission provided valuable assistance in the preparation of the paper for publication.

The views expressed in this paper are those of the authors and do not necessarily reflect the views of the Productivity Commission, or of the external organisations or people who provided assistance.

# Abbreviations and explanations

AAC Australian Aluminium Council

ABARE Australian Bureau of Agricultural and Resource Economics

ABS Australian Bureau of Statistics

ACCC Australian Competition and Consumer Commission

ACCI Australian Chamber for Commerce and Industry

AFFA Agriculture, Fisheries and Forestry Australia

Ai Group Australian Industry Group

AIHW Australian Institute of Health and Welfare

AIP Australian Institute of Petroleum

ANZSIC06 Australian and New Zealand Standard Industrial Classification, 2006 edition

ANZSIC93 Australian and New Zealand Standard Industrial Classification, 1993 edition

ASIC Australian Standard Industrial Classification

ATO Australian Taxation Office

BERD business expenditure on research and development

BREE Bureau of Resource and Energy Economics

BT Beverage and tobacco manufacturing

CVM chain volume measure

DAFF Department of Agriculture, Fisheries and Forestry

EAS Economic Activity Survey

FBT Food, beverage and tobacco products

GFC global financial crisis

GFCF gross fixed capital formation

GOS gross operating surplus

GVA gross value added

HoRSCE House of Representatives Standing Committee on Economics

IO input-output

IOIG Input-Output Industry Groups

LFS Labour Force Survey

LHS left-hand side

LP labour productivity

ME Machinery and equipment manufacturing

MFP multifactor productivity

MP Metal products

M&E machinery and equipment (asset type)

NDC non-dwelling construction

NM Non-metallic mineral products

NZTE New Zealand Trade and Enterprise

OECD Organisation for Economic Co-operation and Development

PC Productivity Commission

PCCR Petroleum, coal, chemical and rubber products

PIM perpetual inventory method

PKS productive capital stock

PNCE private new capital expenditure

PPI producer price index

PRM Printing and recorded media

R&D research and development

RHS right-hand side

SITC Standard International Trade Classification

TCO Textile, clothing and footwear

TWI trade weighted index

UN United Nations

VA value added

WP Wood and paper products

Explanations

|  |  |
| --- | --- |
| Billion | The convention used for a billion is a thousand million (109). |